

1 THE HONORABLE THOMAS S. ZILLY
2
3
4
5
6

7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON

8 BUNGIE, INC.,
9

v.
10 Plaintiff,

11 AIMJUNKIES.COM; PHOENIX
12 DIGITAL GROUP LLC; DAVID
SCHAEFER; JORDAN GREEN;
13 JEFFREY CONWAY; and JAMES MAY,

14 Defendants.

No. 2:21-cv-811-TSZ

[PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING
PLAINTIFF BUNGIE, INC.'S MOTION
FOR SPOILATION SANCTIONS
UNDER FED. R. CIV. P. 37(E)

15 THIS MATTER came before the Court for hearing on Plaintiff Bungie, Inc.'s ("Bungie")
16 Motion for Discovery Sanctions and to Compel Discovery Responses (Dkt. No. 100) and Bungie's
17 Supplemental Briefing in Support of Spoliation Sanctions Under Fed. R. Civ. P. 37(e)
18 (collectively, the "Motion"). Now, having reviewed the parties' briefing, declarations, and
19 exhibits attached thereto, it is hereby ORDERED that Bungie's Motion is GRANTED, it is further:

20 ORDERED that Bungie is awarded monetary sanctions for Defendants' spoliation to the
21 extent not duplicative of those sanctions imposed in Arbitrator Cox's Final Award (Dkt. No. 89-
22 1);

23 ORDERED that Bungie shall submit a declaration accounting for the attorneys' fees and
24 other costs expended in connection with Defendants' spoliation, including Bungie's attorneys' fees
25 and costs incurred in investigating and litigating Defendants' spoliation;

26 [PROPOSED] ORDER
(No. 2:21-cv-811-TSZ) – 1

1 ORDERED that, because Defendants deleted relevant evidence with an intent to deprive
2 Bungie of its use of the spoliated evidence after they had a duty to preserve such evidence, an
3 adverse inference is entered regarding the content of and reason for deleting the following:

- 4 1. financial documents and data related to the AimJunkies.com website that would
5 have shown how many copies of Defendants' *Destiny 2* cheat software (the "Cheat
6 Software") were sold;
- 7 2. records relating to the Cheat Software, the Cheat Software loader, and the
8 AimJunkies.com Terms of Service from the AimJunkies.com website;
- 9 3. marketing and promotional materials relating to the Cheat Software, including
10 those featuring images from Bungie's *Destiny 2* video game; and
- 11 4. the C, D, F, and H drives from Mr. May's computer, which he alleges Bungie
12 accessed.

13 ORDERED that, because Defendants deleted relevant evidence with the intent to deprive
14 Bungie of its use of the spoliated evidence after they had a duty to preserve such evidence, the
15 following counterclaims are DISMISSED with prejudice:

- 16 1. Phoenix Digital Group LLC's First Amended Counterclaim for breach of
17 contract; and
- 18 2. James May's First, Second, and Third Amended Counterclaims under the
19 Computer Fraud and Abuse Act (18 U.S.C. §§ 1030(a)(4), 1030(a)(2)(C), and
20 1030(a)(5)(C)) and Fourth Amended Counterclaim under the Digital Millennium
21 Copyright Act (17 U.S.C. § 1201(a)), to the extent those claims rely on Bungie's
22 alleged access of any files on the C, D, F, and H drives from Mr. May's computer.

23 **IT IS SO ORDERED**

24
25
26
[PROPOSED] ORDER
(No. 2:21-cv-811-TSZ) – 2

DATED this _____ day of _____, 2023.

Honorable Thomas S. Zilly
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Presented by:

/s/ William C. Rava

William C. Rava, WSBA No. 29948
Christian W. Marcelo, WSBA No. 51193
Jacob P. Dini, WSBA No. 54115
Perkins Coie LLP
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900
Seattle, WA 98101-3099
Telephone: 206.359.8000
Facsimile: 206.359.9000
Email: WRava@perkinscoie.com
CMarcelo@perkinscoie.com
JDini@perkinscoie.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Bungie, Inc.

[PROPOSED] ORDER
(No. 2:21-cv-811-TSZ) – 3